EVALUATION REPORT
(As Per Rules 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

1. Name of Procuring Agency: Karachi Infrastructure Development Company Ltd. (KIDCL).
   Ministry of Communications, Government of Pakistan.

2. Method of Procurement: Single-Stage Two Envelop under Rule 36(b) Public Procurement Rules 2004

3. Title of Procurement: SEGMENT: 1 SURJANI TO 2 MINUTE CHOWRANGI

4. Tender Inquiry No: Contract Package # KAR/BRTS/GL/05

5. PPRA Ref. No (TSE): TS 273505E

6. Date & Time of Bid Closing: 27th April 2016, 1100 Hrs

7. Date & Time of Bid Opening: 27th April 2016, 2016. 1300 Hrs

8. No. of Bids Received: Nine (09) - As mentioned below


Evaluation/Qualification Criteria

A) The bidder must meet all mandatory criteria
   i) Registration with PEC
   ii) Registration with Income Tax Department
   iii) Conflict of Interest
   iv) Blacklisting
   v) Litigation History
   vi) History of Non Performing contracts
   vii) Failure to Sign Contract
   viii) Quality Policy
   ix) Health and Safety Policy
   x) Financial Situation
      a. Average Net working Capital for last three years: PKR 150 million.
      b. Average Net worth for last three years' PKR 300 million.
      c. Average Annual Construction Turnover PKR 1900 million.
   xi) Work Experience
      Similar Work with cost and complexity (one similar project), completed in the past Ten (10) years: PKR 1400 Million (Indexation of 7 % per annum will be applied)

Single Entity: Must Meet
Joint Venture: Each Member as Per their Share in the JV
Foreign firms if participating in the bidding process should strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation.

B) Weightages/Marks

a) Financial Soundness .......................... 30 Marks Max
b) Work Experience ............................. 30 Marks Max
c) Work Programme ............................. 10 Marks Max
d) Work Methodology ........................... 10 Marks Max
e) Key Personnel ................................. 10 Marks Max
f) Plant & Equipment ............................ 10 Marks Max

For Technical Qualification, Passing Mark = 75%

10. Nine bidders submitted sealed bids. Twenty One (21) firms purchased Tender Documents

The bidders who submitted sealed Bid on the Closing date

1. Echo West International (Pvt) Ltd
2. NPI Construction Engineering
3. Maqbool Associates (Pvt) Ltd
4. Qalamder Bux Abro & Company
5. NLC Engineers
6. FS.MS.H (JV)
7. Zahir Khan and Brothers
8. Reliance Consultancy & Engineering works
9. Usmani JV Reliable

The Unqualified bidders and Reasons for failure to disqualify.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Bidder</th>
<th>Reasons for Failure to Qualify The Technical Proposals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>M/s Qalander Bux Abro &amp; Company</td>
<td>Failed due to the following reason. Despite specific clarifications requested, the bidder failed to provide admissible documentary evidence as to the completion of similar specific work experience / for claimed project (Metro bus Islamabad, package 2, sublet works). Neither Completion Certificate Verified by Engineer/ Employer Nor Sublet Agreement / Last Paid Invoice provided to substantiate the claim</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M/s FS.MS.H (JV)</td>
<td>Failed due to the following reason. Your technical bid was not substantially responsive to the technical requirements as enlisted in the I.B clauses and Evaluation Criteria, esp. similar specific experience was not demonstrated as to be based on the physical size, complexity, methods / technology or other characteristics;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Name of Bidders Ranking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>NPI Construction Engineering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Zahir Khan and Brothers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Usmani Jv Reliable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Maqbool Associates (pvt) Ltd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>National Logistics Cell Engineers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above bidders were intimated of the outcome and reasons vide letter no. KIDCL (GLBRTS)/GM/2016/1433 – 1436 dated 2.6.2016, and the information was also hoisted on project’s website www.greenline.gov.pk.

The Qualified bidders: Five (05)

11. Any other additional/supporting information the procuring agency may like to share:

After reviewing and in consultation with the project consultants (M/s. EA), clarifications / rate analysis in respect of two items’ rates (SP-10 Concrete Painting and 404b Reinforcement) were requested from the lowest bidder vide KIDCL letter No.KIDCL/Eng/2016/1479 dated 10.6.2016. M/s. NPI Construction & Engineering submitted the requisite rate analysis vide letter No NPI/KHI/GL/05/03 dated.
14.6.2016. While submitting the requisite rate analysis, M/s. NPI undertook that they will “execute the activities strictly according to specifications as per contract”. Project Consultants recommended to get assurance from the lowest bidder on item rate SP-10 Concrete Paining, at the time of contract negotiations.

Combined Evaluation Report, comprising Technical Evaluation Report as approved by the Procurement Committee of BOD and Financial Evaluation, recommending M/s. NPI Construction & Engineering as the lowest evaluated bidder, at the evaluated price of Rs. 1,945,186,801/- (Rupees One Billion Nine Hundred Forty-five Million One Hundred Eighty-six Thousands Eight Hundred and One) was approved by the Board of Directors of KIDCL in its 7th meeting held on 4.7.2016.

Signature

G.M. (Engineering) / Chief Engineer
Karachi Infrastructure Development Co. Ltd. (KIDCL)
Ministry of Communications
Government of Pakistan

Official Stamp