EVALUATION REPORT
(As Per Rules 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

1. Name of Procuring Agency: Karachi Infrastructure Development Company Ltd. (KIDCL).
   Ministry of Communications, Government of Pakistan.

2. Method of Procurement: Single-Stage Two Envelop under Rule 36(b) Public Procurement Rules 2004

3. Title of Procurement: SEGMENT: 2 2 MINUTE CHOWRANGI TO NAGAN CHOWRANGI

4. Tender Inquiry No: Contract Package # KAR/BRTS/GL/04

5. PPRA Ref. No (TSE): TS 273505E

6. Date & Time of Bid Closing: 27th April 2016, 1100 Hrs

7. Date & Time of Bid Opening: 27th April 2016, 2016. 1200 Hrs

8. No. of Bids Received: Eight (08) - As mentioned below


Evaluation/Qualification Criteria

A) The bidder must meet all mandatory criteria
   i) Registration with PEC
   ii) Registration with Income Tax Department
   iii) Conflict of Interest
   iv) Blacklisting
   v) Litigation History
   vi) History of Non Performing contracts
   vii) Failure to Sign Contract
   viii)Quality Policy
   ix) Health and Safety Policy
   x) Financial Situation
      a. Average Net working Capital for last three years: PKR 150 million.
      b. Average Net worth for last three years' PKR 300 million.
      c. Average Annual Construction Turnover' PKR 1900 million.
   xi) Work Experience

Similar Work with cost and complexity (one similar project), completed in the past Ten (10) years: PKR 1400 Million (Indexation of 7 % per annum will be applied)

Single Entity: Must Meet
Joint Venture: Each Member as Per their Share in the JV
Foreign firms if participating in the bidding process should strictly follow the rules stipulated in PEC bye laws for participation.

B) **Weightages/Marks**

a) Financial Soundness 30 Marks Max  
b) Work Experience 30 Marks Max  
c) Work Programme 10 Marks Max  
d) Work Methodology 10 Marks Max  
e) Key Personnel 10 Marks Max  
f) Plant & Equipment 10 Marks Max

**For Technical Qualification, Passing Mark = 75%**

10. Eight bidders submitted sealed bids. Twenty-two (22) firms purchased Tender Documents.

**The bidders who submitted sealed Bid on the Closing date**

1. Echo West International Pvt Ltd  
2. NPI Construction Engineering  
3. Maqbool Associates (Pvt) Ltd  
4. Qalamder Bux Abro & Company  
5. FS.MS.H (JV)  
6. Zahir Khan and Brothers  
7. Reliance Consultancy & Engineering works  
8. Usmani JV Reliable

**The Unqualified bidders and Reasons for failure to disqualify.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Bidders</th>
<th>Reasons for Failure to Qualify The Technical Proposals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 M/s Qalander Bux Abro &amp; Company</td>
<td>Failed due to the following reason. Despite specific clarifications requested, the bidder failed to provide admissible documentary evidence as to the completion of similar specific work experience / for claimed project (Metro bus Islamabad, package 2, sublet works). Neither Completion Certificate Verified by Engineer/ Employer Nor Sublet Agreement / Last Paid Invoice provided to substantiate the claim</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 M/s FS.MS.H (JV)</td>
<td>Failed due to the following reason. Your technical bid was not substantially responsive to the technical requirements as enlisted in the IB clauses and Evaluation Criteria, esp. similar specific experience was not demonstrated as to be based on the physical size, complexity, methods / technology or other characteristics;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>M/s Reliance Consultancy &amp; Engineering works</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Echo West International( Pvt) Ltd</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above bidders were intimated of the outcome and reasons vide letter no. KIDCL (GLBRTS)/GM/2016/1490 – 1493 dated 15.6.2016, and the information was also hoisted on project’s website www.greenline.gov.pk.

**The Qualified bidders 4**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Bidders Ranking</th>
<th>Technical Score</th>
<th>Bid Price (PKR)</th>
<th>Evaluated Cost (PKR)</th>
<th>Rule/Regulation/SBDB/ Policy Basis for / Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 PP Rules,2004</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 NPI Construction Engineering</td>
<td>83.18/100</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Usmanji JV Reliable</td>
<td>76.31/100</td>
<td>1,978,097,725/-</td>
<td>1,978,097,725/-</td>
<td>0.50% below</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Zahir Khan and Brothers</td>
<td>97.20/100</td>
<td>2,019,784,071/-</td>
<td>2,019,784,071/-</td>
<td>1.70% above</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Maqbool Associates (Pvt) Ltd</td>
<td>84.82/100</td>
<td>2,112,475,760/-</td>
<td>2,112,475,760/-</td>
<td>6.58% above</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Lowest Evaluated Bidder: M/s Usmanji JV Reliable

11. Any other additional/supporting information the procuring agency may like to share:

After reviewing and in consultation with the project consultants (M/s. EA), clarifications / rate analysis in respect of three items' rates (SP-10 Concrete Painting, SP-12 Pile Integrity Testing and SP-8 Provide Employer Vehicle) were requested from the lowest bidder vide KIDCL letter No. KIDCL/Eng/2016/1524 dated 24.6.2016. M/s. Usmanji JV Reliable submitted the requisite rate analysis vide letter No. UIA/KIDCL/DT/2016/194 dated 27.6.2016. Project Consultants recommended to get assurance of compliance to specifications from the lowest bidder on item rate SP-10 Concrete Painting, at the time of contract negotiations.
Combined Evaluation Report, comprising Technical Evaluation Report as approved by the Procurement Committee of BOD and Financial Evaluation, recommending M/s. Usmani JV Reliable as the lowest evaluated bidder, at the evaluated price of Rs. 1,997,169,419/- (Rupees One Billion Nine Hundred Ninety Seven Million One Hundred Sixty-Nine Thousands Four Hundred and Nineteen only) was approved by the Board of Directors of KIDCL in its meeting held on 4.7.2016.

Signature...

G.M. (Engineering)/ Chief Engineer
Karachi Infrastructure Development Co. Ltd. (KIDCL)
Ministry of Communications
Government of Pakistan

Official Stamp..........................