EVALUATION REPORT
(As Per Rules 35 of PP Rules, 2004)


3. Title of Procurement: Construction of RCC Elevated Section Nazimabad Chowangi to Guru Mandir

4. Tender Inquiry No: Contract Package # KAR/BRTS/GL/01

5. PPRA Ref. No (TSE): TS249301E

6. Date & Time of Bid Closing: 25th August, 2015, 1200 Hrs

7. Date & Time of Bid Opening: 25th August, 2015, 1300 Hrs

8. No. of Bids Received: Seven (07) – As mentioned below


Evaluation/Qualification Criteria

A) The bidder must meet all mandatory criteria
   i) Registration with PEC
   ii) Registration with Income Tax Department
   iii) Conflict of Interest
   iv) Blacklisting
   v) Litigation History
   vi) History of Non Performing Contracts
   vii) Failure to Sign Contract
   viii) Quality Policy
   ix) Health and Safety Policy
   x) Financial Situation
      a. Average Net working Capital for last three years: PKR 300 million
      b. Average Net worth for last three years: PKR 600 million
      c. Average Annual Construction Turnover: PKR 4,000 million
   xi) Work Experience
      Similar fast tract assignment with cost (one similar project), under-taken over in the past five (05) years: PKR 2,500 million
      Single Entity: Must Meet
      Joint Venture: Each member as per their share in JV

B) Weightages/Marks
   a) Financial Soundness 30 Marks Max
   b) Work Experience 30 Marks Max
   c) Work Programme 10 Marks Max
   d) Work Methodology 10 Marks Max
   e) Key Personal 10 Marks Max
   f) Plant & Equipment 10 Marks Max
   For Technical Qualification, Passing Mark = 75%
10. Seven (7) bidders submitted sealed bids. The Twenty One (22) firms who obtained Tender Documents.

The bidders who submitted Sealed Bid on the closing date

1. M/s. CRFG – MATRACON
2. M/s. Maqbool Associates Ltd
3. M/s. SADB – Usmani JV
4. M/s. Zahir Khan & Brothers
5. M/S Sultan Muhammad & Company
6. Echo West International (Pvt) Ltd
7. M/S Qalander Bux Abro & Company & NTF Construction (Jv)

The Unqualified bidders and Reasons for failure to qualify

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Bidder</th>
<th>Reasons for Failure to Qualify The Technical Proposals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>M/s Sultan Muhammad &amp; Company</td>
<td>• Failure in Eligibility Criteria of mandatory clause 1.1 (xi) Work Experience i.e. similar fast track assignments with cost (one similar project), under-taken over in the past five (05) years: PKR 2,500 million, as already provided in the NIT as well.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| M/s Echo West International (Pvt) Ltd | • Failure in Eligibility Criteria of mandatory clause 1.1 (xi) Work Experience i.e. similar fast track assignments with cost (one similar project), under-taken over in the past five (05) years: PKR 2,500 million, as already provided in the NIT as well.  
• Failure in Eligibility Criteria of Clause 1.1(i) not meeting the mandatory requirement of valid Registration with PEC (Dec-2015) in Category CA and in disciplines (CE01, CE02 and CE10) |
| M/S Qalander Bux Abro & Company & NTF Construction (Jv) | • Failure in mandatory Criteria of Clause 1.1(x) Historical Financial Performance criteria (c) average annual construction turnover for last three years PKR 4,000 Million.  
• Failure in Eligibility Criteria of mandatory clause 1.1 (xi) Work Experience i.e. similar fast track assignments with cost (one similar project), under-taken over in the past five (05) years: PKR 2,500 million, as already provided in the NIT as well. |

The Qualified bidders

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Bidder</th>
<th>Marks obtained Technical</th>
<th>Evaluated Cost</th>
<th>Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/ Basis for Rejection/ Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>M/s. CRFG– MATRACON</td>
<td>86 / 100</td>
<td>PKR. 1,813,614,183/-</td>
<td>In accordance to Financial Bid Opening M/s CRFG-Matracon (JV) RS. 1,813,614,183/- was found to be Lowest Bidder subject to financial evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M/s. Maqbool Associates Ltd</td>
<td>80/100</td>
<td>PKR. 1,859,708,505/-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M/s. SADB – Usmani JV</td>
<td>87 / 100</td>
<td>PKR. 2,033,060,559/-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M/s. Zahir Khan &amp; Brothers</td>
<td>81.25 / 100</td>
<td>PKR. 2,230,195,346/-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Lowest Bidder: M/s CRFG-Matracon (JV)

11. Any other additional / supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share.

Signature: .................................................................
Karnal Infrastructure Development Company Limited (KIDCL)
Government of Pakistan

Official Stamp: ...........................................................